

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS

DALLAS DIVISION

IN RE: DEPUY ORTHOPAEDICS,	(	3: 11-MD-2244-K
INC. PINNACLE HIP IMPLANT	(	
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION	(	
	(	MDL Docket No.
	(	
	(	
	(	SEPTEMBER 10, 2013

-----  
This Document Relates to all Cases  
-----

TRANSCRIPT OF STATUS CONFERENCE

BEFORE THE HONORABLE ED KINKEADE

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

A P P E A R A N C E S:

FOR THE PLAINTIFF: LARRY P. BOYD  
Fisher Boyd Brown & Huguenard LLP  
2777 Allen Pkwy  
14th Floor  
Houston, TX 77019  
713/400-4000  
Email: lboyd@fisherboyd.com

Jayne Conroy  
Hanly Conroy Bierstein Sheridan  
Fisher & Hayes LLP  
112 Madison Ave  
7th Floor  
New York, NY 10016  
212/784-6410  
Email: jconroy@hanlyconroy.com

W. MARK LANIER  
The Lanier Law Firm  
6810 FM 1960 West  
Houston, TX 77069  
713/659-5200  
cag@lanierlawfirm.com

FOR THE DEFENDANTS: JOHN H. BEISNER  
Skadden Arps Slate Meagher & Flom LLP  
1440 New York Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20005-2111  
202-371-7209  
John.Beisner@skadden.com

KENNETH H. INSKEEP  
Barnes & Thornburg LLP  
11 S Meridian St  
Indianapolis, IN 46204  
317/231-7242  
Email: kinskeep@btlaw.com

MICHAEL V. POWELL  
Locke Lord Bissell & Liddell LLP  
2200 Ross Ave  
Suite 2200  
Dallas, TX 75201-6776  
214/740-8520  
Email: mpowell@lockelord.com

SETH MICHAEL ROBERTS  
Locke Lord Bissell & Liddell LLP  
2200 Ross Ave.  
Suite 2200  
Dallas, TX 75204  
214/740-8453  
Email: sroberts@lockelord.com

STEPHEN J. HARBURG  
Skadden Arps Slate Meagher & Flom LLP  
1440 New York Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20005  
202/371-7470  
Email: Stephen.Harburg@skadden.com

ALSO PRESENT:

Richard Arsenault  
Alex Brown  
Wayne Fisher  
Paul Hanly  
Stephen Harburg  
Bruce Hurley  
Bernard Johnson  
Laura Singletary  
Tracy Van Steenburg  
Andrew White  
Gene Williams

SPECIAL MASTER: JAMES M. STANTON  
Stanton Law Firm PC  
4350 Beltway Drive  
Addison, TX 75001  
972/233-2300  
Email: Stanton@StantonTrialFirm.com

COURT REPORTER: PAMELA J. WILSON, RMR, CRR  
1100 Commerce Street, Room 1525  
Dallas, Texas 75242  
214.662.1557  
pam\_wilson@txnd.uscourts.gov

Proceedings reported by mechanical stenography,  
transcript produced by computer.

**P R O C E E D I N G S**

THE SECURITY OFFICER: All rise and come to order.

The United States District Court in and for the Northern District of Texas at Dallas is now in session, the Honorable United States District Judge Ed Kinkeade is presiding.

Let us pray.

God bless these United States and this Honorable Court.

Please be seated.

THE COURT: Okay. We've got a status conference today on the DePuy MDL -- excuse me -- litigation, cause number 3:11-MD-2244-K.

Let me just give the lawyers an opportunity to speak on behalf of the -- both sides.

First, Mr. Beisner, you're here on behalf of the defense and is there anything you need to say with regard to where we are?

I've ruled on the deposition and the other discovery issues and the only thing I think we were -- that was left in talking about was on the belwethers and that sort of thing, so why don't you give me a little report.

MR. BEISNER. Sure, Your Honor. I think that the parties have been moving along well in the discovery process. Mr. Boyd may have some things to add on that. But we've been very busy in the -- the deposition process, I think consistent with the -- with the schedule that the court had in mind.

1 As Your Honor noted, we have been talking about the  
2 belwether trial process, and I think we have some  
3 conversations to complete in that regard, hopefully to provide  
4 your court -- the court with a joint proposal in that regard.

5 Your Honor, I did want to note that with respect to a  
6 filing that we made with the court on Friday with respect to  
7 one aspect of the bellwether selection process, I did -- did  
8 want to note, Your Honor, that our position -- we have waived  
9 the lexicon restriction on these -- these cases, consistent  
10 with the report that the special master gave to the court  
11 earlier. And I just wanted to make sure that we were clear on  
12 that on -- on the record.

13 We have some concerns about whether the factual text in  
14 which that waiver was given may have changed with the proposal  
15 now for multiplaintiff trials, so we may come back to Your  
16 Honor for some relief on that waiver, depending on how all of  
17 this unfolds, but did just want to confirm to the court that  
18 that --

19 THE COURT: Okay.

20 MR. BEISNER: -- that is -- that is the defendant's  
21 position.

22 THE COURT: Okay. Well, we'll look at that when we  
23 get there.

24 Anything else from anybody else on the defense side,  
25 Mr. Beisner?

1 That's it?

2 MR. BEISNER: I don't believe so.

3 THE COURT: Okay.

4 MR. BEISNER: Unless someone else has something to  
5 add, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

7 Mr. Boyd, Mr. Lanier, either of y'all -- both of y'all?

8 MR. BOYD: Your Honor, Mr. Lanier is going to give  
9 you the report.

10 THE COURT: All right. That will be fine. Thank  
11 you.

12 Thank you.

13 MR. LANIER: Thank Mr. Boyd for that.

14 Your Honor, 4,922 cases are currently before you.

15 THE COURT: Is there a cap?

16 Is there a cap?

17 Can I?

18 (Laughter.)

19 MR. LANIER: Yes, Your Honor. We've capped it at a  
20 million.

21 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

22 MR. LANIER: The only cap that exists, Your Honor,  
23 is one that -- by virtue of the fact that August 31st, just a  
24 few days ago, this product is no longer allowed to be  
25 installed by doctors, and so there is some type of a cap out

1 there, but what that cap will be nobody knows.

2 I would say from the plaintiff's perspective, make it  
3 clear on the record, the plaintiffs have also agreed to waive  
4 lexicon with any of the cases that we've got before you. And  
5 we will continue to do so.

6 We also commit to following your strong admonition that  
7 the parties try to find a mutually agreeable solution to the  
8 bellwether process, and we will be speaking extensively and  
9 working with special master James Stanton, who I would be  
10 remiss and the other side would be remiss if we did not note  
11 that we have probably radically messed up his life, requiring  
12 him to traipse all over the globe to be our hall monitor while  
13 we do discovery. But he has done a commendable job, and I  
14 think both sides wanted that on the record, I just got the joy  
15 of getting to say it.

16 THE COURT: Okay.

17 MR. LANIER: So thank you for that, Your Honor.

18 THE COURT: And I want to say for the lawyers that  
19 are on the phone, in the bellwether process, we're still  
20 searching for a process where the lawyers both in the state  
21 and -- and those that have state cases and federal cases will  
22 feel good about this process and -- and what we've done. And  
23 that's the -- otherwise, it's not a bellwether, it's just a  
24 trial. And -- and so I'm still searching for that kind of  
25 process. And I -- I think y'all are working at it and I'm

1 going to assume it will be in good faith.

2 I look forward to seeing y'all again. You're a little  
3 bit older than the last time I saw you, and wiser. And I'm --  
4 I'm enjoying working on this.

5 Look forward to seeing y'all again. And we're making  
6 progress. We've done -- I know you've done really yeoman's  
7 duty on this discovery, and I want to thank everybody, because  
8 I know that's a -- it's been all over the globe and I -- I  
9 appreciate you, you know, I guess spending money with all the  
10 airlines. They need that. And just, you know, keep working  
11 hard. Know that we're making progress on this.

12 I will do my best to be patient with y'all. Y'all be  
13 patient with me. And I just -- I just want the lawyers that  
14 are out there that aren't part of this process to feel  
15 comfortable about if you're on the plaintiff's side contact --  
16 I'm assuming you would be, contact those lawyers if you have  
17 some complaint about something that's occurring and you don't  
18 feel like it's been fair to your cases -- to your clients.  
19 They're not cases. To your clients. Let me know. Let them  
20 know and they will let me know, and I'll be more than happy to  
21 address that.

22 And the same is true if there's something in the process,  
23 Mr. Beisner, you've not hesitated to tell me something you  
24 didn't like, please keep that up. That's -- I will continue  
25 to try to make sure that both of you feel like you're getting



1 your best shot to put the case on that you want to put on  
2 throughout this process.

3 So thank y'all very much.

4 Let me see at the side of the bench for just a second, a  
5 representative from -- from each side, just for a second.

6 But otherwise, that's it.

7 Thank y'all very much.

8 THE SECURITY OFFICER: All rise.

9 (End of proceedings.)

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

<p>&lt; Dates &gt;  August 31st 6: 23  SEPTEMBER 10,  2013 1: 10  September, 2013.  11: 8</p> <p>&lt; 1 &gt;  10016 1: 35  10th 11: 8  11 2: 12  11-MD-2244-K  1: 4, 4: 11  1100 3: 28  112 1: 33  1440 2: 4, 2: 38  14th 1: 25  1525 3: 28  1960 1: 41</p> <p>&lt; 2 &gt;  20005 2: 39  20005-2111 2: 5  202-371-7209 2: 6  202/371-7470  2: 40  212/784-6410  1: 36  214. 662. 1557  3: 30  214/740-8453  2: 32  214/740-8520  2: 23  2200 2: 20, 2: 21,  2: 29, 2: 30  2777 1: 24</p> <p>&lt; 3 &gt;  317/231-7242  2: 14  3: 1: 4, 4: 11</p> <p>&lt; 4 &gt;  4, 922 6: 14  4350 3: 21</p>	<p>46204 2: 13</p> <p>&lt; 6 &gt;  6810 1: 41</p> <p>&lt; 7 &gt;  713/400-4000  1: 27  713/659-5200  1: 43  75001 3: 22  75201-6776 2: 22  75204 2: 31  75242 3: 29  77019 1: 26  77069 1: 42  7th 1: 34</p> <p>&lt; 9 &gt;  972/233-2300  3: 23</p> <p>&lt; A &gt;  add 4: 23, 6: 5  Addi son 3: 22  address 8: 21  admoni ti on 7: 6  ago 6: 24  agreeable 7: 7  agreed 7: 3  air lines 8: 10  Alex 3: 3  Allen 1: 24  allowed 6: 24  Andrew 3: 11  anybody 5: 24  appreciate 8: 9  Arps 2: 3, 2: 37  Arsenault 3: 2  aspect 5: 7  assume 8: 1  assuming 8: 16  Ave 1: 33, 2: 4,  2: 20, 2: 38  Ave. 2: 29</p>	<p>&lt; B &gt;  back 5: 15  Barnes 2: 11  behalf 4: 13,  4: 14  Bei sner 2: 2,  4: 14, 5: 25, 6: 4,  8: 23  believe 6: 2  bellwether 5: 7,  7: 8, 7: 19, 7: 23  Bel tway 3: 21  belwether 5: 2  belwethers 4: 19  bench 9: 4  Bernard 3: 8  best 8: 12, 9: 1  Bi erstein 1: 31  Bi ssell 2: 19,  2: 28  bi t 8: 3  bless 4: 7  Boyd 1: 22, 1: 23,  4: 23, 6: 7, 6: 8,  6: 13  Brown 1: 23, 3: 3  Bruce 3: 7  busy 4: 24</p> <p>&lt; C &gt;  cag@lani erl awfi r  m.com 1: 44  cap 6: 15, 6: 16,  6: 22, 6: 25, 7: 1  capped 6: 19  case 9: 1  Cases 1: 13, 5: 9,  6: 14, 7: 4, 7: 21,  8: 18, 8: 19  cause 4: 10  certi fy 11: 2,  11: 5  changed 5: 14  clear 5: 11, 7: 3  clients 8: 18,  8: 19  comfortable 8: 15  commendabl e 7: 13</p>	<p>Commerce 3: 28  commi t 7: 6  complai nt 8: 17  complete 5: 3  comply 11: 5  computer 3: 34  concerns 5: 13  Conference 1: 16,  4: 9, 11: 6  confirm 5: 17  Conroy 1: 30,  1: 31  consistent 4: 24,  5: 9  contact 8: 15,  8: 16  continue 7: 5,  8: 24  conversations  5: 3  Court 1: 1, 3: 27,  4: 3, 4: 7, 4: 9,  4: 25, 5: 4, 5: 6,  5: 10, 5: 17,  5: 19, 5: 22, 6: 3,  6: 6, 6: 10, 6: 15,  6: 21, 7: 16,  7: 18, 11: 6,  11: 14  CRR 3: 27, 11: 13  CSR 11: 2  currently 6: 14</p> <p>&lt; D &gt;  Dal las 1: 3,  2: 22, 2: 31,  3: 29, 4: 4, 11: 16  day 11: 8  days 6: 24  DC 2: 5, 2: 39  defendant 5: 20  DEFENDANTS 2: 2  defense 4: 14,  5: 24  dependi ng 5: 16  deposi ti on 4: 17,  4: 24  Depuy 1: 4, 4: 10  di scovery 4: 17,</p>
---	--	--	--

<p>4: 22, 7: 13, 8: 7  District 1: 1,  1: 2, 1: 18, 4: 3,  4: 4, 4: 5, 11: 15  Division 1: 3,  11: 16  Docket 1: 7  doctors 6: 25  Document 1: 13  done 7: 13, 7: 22,  8: 6  Drive 3: 21  duty 8: 7</p> <p>&lt; E &gt;  earlier 5: 11  Ed 1: 17, 4: 5  either 6: 7  Email 1: 28,  1: 37, 2: 15,  2: 24, 2: 33,  2: 41, 3: 24  End 9: 9  enjoying 8: 4  entitled 11: 4  everybody 8: 7  excuse 4: 10  exists 6: 22  extensively 7: 8</p> <p>&lt; F &gt;  fact 6: 23  factual 5: 13  fair 8: 18  faith 8: 1  federal 7: 21  feel 7: 22, 8: 14,  8: 18, 8: 25  fees 11: 5  few 6: 24  filing 5: 6  find 7: 7  fine 6: 10  Firm 1: 40, 3: 20  First 4: 14  Fisher 1: 23,  1: 32, 3: 4  Flom 2: 3, 2: 37</p>	<p>Floor 1: 25, 1: 34  FM 1: 41  following 7: 6  foregoing 11: 2,  11: 3  format 11: 5  forward 8: 2, 8: 5  Friday 5: 6</p> <p>&lt; G &gt;  gave 5: 10  Gene 3: 12  getting 7: 15,  8: 25  give 4: 12, 4: 20,  6: 8  given 5: 14  globe 7: 12, 8: 8  God 4: 7  guess 8: 9</p> <p>&lt; H &gt;  H. 2: 2, 2: 10  hall 7: 12  Hanly 1: 31, 3: 5  happy 8: 20  Harburg 2: 36,  3: 6  hard 8: 11  Hayes 1: 32  hesitated 8: 23  HIP 1: 5  Honor 4: 21, 5: 1,  5: 5, 5: 8, 5: 16,  6: 5, 6: 8, 6: 14,  6: 19, 6: 22, 7: 17  Honorable 1: 17,  4: 4, 4: 7  hopefully 5: 3  Houston 1: 26,  1: 42  Huguenard 1: 23  Hurley 3: 7</p> <p>&lt; I &gt;  IMPLANT 1: 5  INC. 1: 5</p>	<p>Indi anapol i s  2: 13  INSKEEP 2: 10  installed 6: 25  issues 4: 18</p> <p>&lt; J &gt;  J. 2: 36, 3: 27,  11: 2, 11: 12,  11: 13  James 3: 19, 7: 9  Jayne 1: 30  jconroy@hanlycon  roy.com 1: 37  job 7: 13  JOHN 2: 2  John. bei sner@ska  dden.com 2: 7  Johnson 3: 8  joint 5: 4  joy 7: 14  Judge 1: 18, 4: 5  Judicial 11: 6</p> <p>&lt; K &gt;  keep 8: 10, 8: 24  KENNETH 2: 10  kind 7: 24  Kinkeade 1: 17,  4: 5  kinskeep@btlaw.c  om 2: 15  knows 7: 1</p> <p>&lt; L &gt;  LANIER 1: 39,  1: 40, 6: 7, 6: 8,  6: 13, 6: 19,  6: 22, 7: 17  LARRY 1: 22  last 8: 3  Laughter. 6: 18  Laura 3: 9  Law 1: 40, 3: 20  lawyers 4: 12,  7: 18, 7: 20,  8: 13, 8: 16</p>	<p>I boyd@fi sherboyd  .com 1: 28  left 4: 18  lexicon 5: 9, 7: 4  LIABILITY 1: 6  Liddell 2: 19,  2: 28  life 7: 11  LITIGATION 1: 6,  4: 10  little 4: 20, 8: 2  LLP 1: 23, 1: 32,  2: 3, 2: 11, 2: 19,  2: 28, 2: 37  Locke 2: 19, 2: 28  longer 6: 24  Look 5: 22, 8: 2,  8: 5  Lord 2: 19, 2: 28</p> <p>&lt; M &gt;  M. 3: 19  Madi son 1: 33  MARK 1: 39  MASTER 3: 19,  5: 10, 7: 9  matter 11: 4  MDL 1: 7, 4: 10  Meagher 2: 3,  2: 37  mechanical 3: 33  Meri di an 2: 12  messed 7: 11  MICHAEL 2: 18,  2: 27  million. 6: 20  mind 4: 25  money 8: 9  moni tor 7: 12  moving 4: 22  mpowel l@lockel or  d.com 2: 24  MR. BEISNER  4: 21, 5: 20, 6: 2  mul ti plai nti ff  5: 15  mutual ly 7: 7</p>
---	--	---	---

<p>&lt; N &gt;          need 4: 15, 8: 10          New 1: 35, 2: 4,          2: 38          No. 1: 7          nobody 7: 1          Northern 1: 2,          4: 3, 11: 15          note 5: 5, 5: 8,          7: 10          noted 5: 1          number 4: 11          NW 2: 4, 2: 38          NY 1: 35</p> <p>&lt; O &gt;          occurring 8: 17          OFFICER 4: 2, 9: 8          Official 11: 14          Okay 4: 9, 5: 19,          5: 22, 6: 3, 6: 6,          6: 21, 7: 16          older 8: 3          one 5: 7, 6: 23          opportunity 4: 12          order 4: 2          ORTHOPAEDICS 1: 4          otherwise 7: 23,          9: 6</p> <p>&lt; P &gt;          P. 1: 22          pam_wilson@txnd.          uscourts.gov          3: 31          PAMELA 3: 27,          11: 2, 11: 13          part 8: 14          parties 4: 22,          7: 7          patient 8: 12,          8: 13          Paul 3: 5          PC 3: 20          perspective 7: 2          phone 7: 19          PINNACLE 1: 5          Pkwy 1: 24</p>	<p>PLAINTIFF 1: 22,          7: 2, 8: 15          plaintiffs 7: 3          Please 4: 8, 8: 24          position 5: 8,          5: 21          POWELL 2: 18          pray 4: 6          prescribed 11: 6          PRESENT 3: 1          presiding 4: 5          probably 7: 11          Proceedings          3: 33, 11: 3          proceedings. 9: 9          process 4: 22,          4: 24, 5: 2, 5: 7,          7: 8, 7: 19, 7: 20,          7: 22, 7: 25,          8: 14, 8: 22, 9: 2          produced 3: 34          product 6: 24          PRODUCTS 1: 6          progress 8: 6,          8: 11          proposal 5: 4,          5: 14          provide 5: 3          put 9: 1</p> <p>&lt; R &gt;          radically 7: 11          RE 1: 4          really 8: 6          record 5: 12,          7: 3, 7: 14, 11: 3          regard 4: 15,          5: 3, 5: 4          Relates 1: 13          relief 5: 16          remiss 7: 10          report 4: 20,          5: 10, 6: 9          reported 3: 33          Reporter 3: 27,          11: 14          representative          9: 5          requiring 7: 11</p>	<p>respect 5: 5, 5: 6          restriction 5: 9          Richard 3: 2          rise 4: 2, 9: 8          RMR 3: 27, 11: 13          ROBERTS 2: 27          Room 3: 28          Ross 2: 20, 2: 29          ruled 4: 17</p> <p>&lt; S &gt;          s/pamela 11: 12          saw 8: 3          schedule 4: 25          searching 7: 20,          7: 24          seated 4: 8          second 9: 4, 9: 5          SECURITY 4: 2,          9: 8          seeing 8: 2, 8: 5          selection 5: 7          session 4: 4          SETH 2: 27          Sheridan 1: 31          shot 9: 1          side 5: 24, 7: 10,          8: 15, 9: 4, 9: 5          sides 4: 13, 7: 14          Singletary 3: 9          Skadden 2: 3,          2: 37          Slate 2: 3, 2: 37          solution 7: 7          someone 6: 4          sort 4: 19          speaking 7: 8          SPECIAL 3: 19,          5: 10, 7: 9          spending 8: 9          sroberts@lockel o          rd.com 2: 33          St 2: 12          Stanton 3: 19,          3: 20, 7: 9          Stanton@stantont          rial firm.com          3: 24          state 7: 20, 7: 21</p> <p>States 1: 1,          1: 18, 4: 3, 4: 5,          4: 7, 11: 7          STATUS 1: 16, 4: 9          Steenburg 3: 10          stenography 3: 33          Stephen 2: 36,          3: 6          Stephen.harburg@          skadden.com 2: 41          Street 3: 28          strong 7: 6          Suite 2: 21, 2: 30</p> <p>&lt; T &gt;          Texas 1: 2, 3: 29,          4: 4, 11: 15          text 5: 13          Thornburg 2: 11          throughout 9: 2          today 4: 10          Tracy 3: 10          traipse 7: 12          TRANSCRIPT 1: 16,          3: 34, 11: 3, 11: 5          trial 5: 2, 7: 24          trials 5: 15          true 8: 22          try 7: 7, 8: 25          TX 1: 26, 1: 42,          2: 22, 2: 31, 3: 22          type 6: 25</p> <p>&lt; U &gt;          unfolds 5: 17          United 1: 1,          1: 18, 4: 3, 4: 5,          4: 7, 11: 7          Unless 6: 4</p> <p>&lt; V &gt;          V. 2: 18          Van 3: 10          virtue 6: 23</p> <p>&lt; W &gt;</p>
---	--	---

W. 1: 39  
waive 7: 3  
waived 5: 8  
waiver 5: 14,  
5: 16  
wanted 5: 11,  
7: 14  
Washington 2: 5,  
2: 39  
Wayne 3: 4  
West 1: 41  
whether 5: 13  
White 3: 11  
will 6: 10, 7: 1,  
7: 5, 7: 8, 7: 21,  
8: 1, 8: 12, 8: 20,  
8: 24  
Williams 3: 12  
WILSON 3: 27,  
11: 2, 11: 12,  
11: 13  
wiser 8: 3  
working 7: 9,  
7: 25, 8: 4, 8: 10

< Y >  
Y'all 6: 7, 7: 25,  
8: 2, 8: 5, 8: 12,  
9: 3, 9: 7  
yeoman 8: 6  
York 1: 35, 2: 4,  
2: 38

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, PAMELA J. WILSON, CSR, certify that the foregoing is a transcript from the record of the proceedings in the foregoing entitled matter.

I further certify that the transcript fees format comply with those prescribed by the Court and the Judicial Conference of the United States.

This the 10th day of September, 2013.

s/Pamela J. Wilson  
PAMELA J. WILSON, RMR, CRR  
Official Court Reporter  
The Northern District of Texas  
Dallas Division